

1. CONSULTATION RESPONSES

1.1 The following table shows how responses to the consultation were submitted and the number received:

<u>Method of Submission</u>	<u>Number Received</u>
Online response form	647
Letters and emails	3
	650

2. Post 16 Transport

The following tables outline the options included in the consultation and show the number of online responses for and against each of the proposals.

2.1 Option 1

Maintain status quo. The Council will retain the current level of post 16 transport provision to all the educational establishments referred to in the current Transport Policy. Current cost is £860k.

Responses

	Number	Percentage
YES	566	87.48%
NO	81	12.52%
TOTAL	647	100%

2.2 Option 2

Introduce a charge for all post 16 transport provision to all the educational establishments referred to in the current Transport Policy.

Examples of charges

Charge to Parent per term (£)	Charge to Parent Annually (£)	Gross income (£)	Remaining cost pressure (£)
50.00	150.00	293,000	560,000
80.00	240.00	468,000	385,000
100.00	300.00	585,000	268,000
150.00	450.000	877,500	Nil

Responses

	Number	Percentage
YES	60	9.92%

NO	545	90.08%
TOTAL	605	100%

If you have answered “yes” to the proposal to introduce a charge, how much do you think would be reasonable?

Charge per term (£)	Number of responses	Percentage
50.00	69	74.19%
80.00	9	9.68%
100.00	3	3.23%
150.00*	12	12.90%
TOTAL	93	100%

*£150.00 will be the cost of a concessionary seat on learner transport from September 2019. A concessionary seat is one that can be bought by a learner who does not have a statutory entitlement to free transport.

2.3 Option 3

Introduce a charge for all post 16 transport to all educational establishments referred to in the current Transport Policy as in Option 2 but the charge be waived for learners who are eligible for free school meals.

Examples of Charges

Charge per term (£)	Charge per annum (£)	Gross income (£)
50.00	150.00	249,000
80.00	240.00	398,000
100.00	300.00	498,000
150.00*	450.00	728,375
173.00	519.00	860,500**

*£150.00 will be the cost of a concessionary seat on learner transport from September 2019. A concessionary seat is one that can be bought by a learner who does not have a statutory entitlement to free transport.

** Represents full cost recovery of post 16 transport

Responses

	Number	Percentage
YES	83	13.74%
NO	521	86.26%
TOTAL	604	100%

If you have answered “yes” to the proposal to introduce a charge, how much do you think would be reasonable?

Charge per term (£)	Number of responses	Percentage
50.00	62	63.92%
80.00	15	15.46%
100.00	6	6.19%

150.00*	3	3.09%
173.00**	11	11.34%
TOTAL	97	100%

*£150.00 will be the cost of a concessionary seat on learner transport from September 2019. A concessionary seat is one that can be bought by a learner who does not have a statutory entitlement to free transport.

** Represents full cost recovery of post 16 transport

2.4 Option 4

Discontinue learner transport for all post 16 students and all learners to make their own arrangements. Saving – £860k.

Responses

	Number	Percentage
YES	46	7.59%
NO	560	92.41%
TOTAL	606	100%

2.5 Option 5

Exclude **Welsh Medium** schools from Options 2 and 3 (approx. 35 students).

Responses

	Number	Percentage
YES	162	27.09%
NO	436	72.91%
TOTAL	598	100%

2.6 Option 6

Exclude **Welsh Medium and denominational** schools from Options 2 and 3 (approx.. 135 students).

Responses

	Number	Percentage
YES	135	22.54%
NO	464	77.46%
TOTAL	599	100%

3. Benefits entitlement

3.1 Option 7

Maintain status quo and continue the current “benefits” policy (current cost approximately £10k).

Responses

	Number	Percentage
YES	436	73.40%
NO	158	26.60%
TOTAL	594	100%

3.2 Option 8

Remove the “benefits” provision completely for all learners with effect from September 2020 (saving approx. £10k).

Responses

	Number	Percentage
YES	41	6.88%
NO	555	93.12%
TOTAL	596	100%

3.3 Option 9

Phase out the “benefits” provision i.e. no new students to receive free transport under this criterion with effect from September 2020 (saving approx. £10k after 2 years, ie by September 2022).

Responses

	Number	Percentage
YES	53	8.88%
NO	544	91.12%
TOTAL	597	100%

4. Responses received by letters and email

4.1 Email received from local resident – supports a charge of £240 per year with exemptions for ALN Learners and those in receipt of Income Support/Working Tax Credit.

4.2 Letter from local resident – strongly opposed to any charge.

4.3 Letter from Secondary High School Chair of Governors – opposed to any charge.

5. Response from Flintshire Secondary Headteachers' Federation

Letter from Secondary Heads' Federation – Option 3 provides the best compromise, ie introduce a charge of £100 per term but it should be waived for Learners entitled to free school meals/benefits. The full response from the Heads' Federation is below:

“At its meeting on 13th February, the federation of secondary headteachers discussed the options proposed for post 16 transport in the strategic review of the discretionary transport policy.

All headteachers expressed serious concerns that changes to post 16 transport would reduce options for post 16 learners and would potentially impact on the number of students progressing to post 16 courses. Headteachers felt that students need support to access the post 16 provision most suited to their learning need and that removal of transport could impact on this.

However, headteachers also understand the need to reduce costs and recognise the significant cost of post 16 transport.

Taking into account the need to support learners accessing post 16 education whilst reducing costs, headteachers agreed that option 3 provided the best compromise. This option ensures transport is provided for the most deprived learners and still secures a cost saving of £498,000.

We would be grateful if you could take our views into account in the discussions of the various proposed options.”

6. Response from Coleg Cambria

The full response from Coleg Cambria is below:

The College welcomes the opportunity to provide a response to the proposed options to amend the Council's School and College Transport Policy. The rationale for the proposed changes is clearly stated in the consultation document and the College, as a stakeholder who would be directly affected by any changes, is keen to continue the well established positive and constructive dialogue with senior council officers.

Coleg Cambria is committed to delivering excellent teaching and learning in order to stretch, challenge and inspire all learners to explore and achieve their full potential. The College provides a comprehensive, flexible and responsive curriculum offer which enhances learning opportunities and provides a broader range of provision and options for all learners - whatever their background. The provision of appropriate transport plays an important role in supporting young people to participate in education and training and importantly to access the education and training of their choice. This contributes to sustaining and improving learner participation, retention and achievement rates.

The College and the Council currently have a strong partnering approach to provide an effective integrated student transport network, which meets the needs of students well, allowing them to access a broad curriculum offer and the education and training of their choice. This approach also recognises some of the significant constraints of the local transport infrastructure and promotes a more sustainable mode of travel.

Whilst the College's preference would be: Option 1 - Maintain status Quo, it recognises the considerable pressure to make savings on public spending and to provide services that can

be delivered more efficiently and cost effectively. If a decision was taken to introduce a charge, it should be introduced in a phased manner with financial support available for students in low income households and kept to a level which would not cause financial hardship. On this basis, Option 3 would appear to be the most suitable and would deliver financial savings.

The College's response on each of the proposed options is set-out below:

OPTION 1 - maintain status quo.

Do you agree with OPTION 1? Yes

In addition:

The transformational change to post-16 provision in Flintshire needs to be considered as part of the consultation proposals. The creation of a new purpose built post-16 facility at Deeside has given students a better and wider choice of subjects at one location in a modern facility with the latest technology. This has also improved the learning experience and removed the need to bus students around the county to different delivery locations and has thus already contributed to reducing transport costs.

Free transport at the time of change would undoubtedly have contributed towards acceptance of the proposal and with the ability to access post-16 education at local schools removed.

The project has made a significant contribution towards delivering the goals of the Wellbeing of Future Generations Act by applying the sustainable development principles to improve the social, economic, environmental and cultural well-being of people living in the communities served by the College.

Failure to allow access to the full provision of vocational skills subjects could lead to issues with equality of access to education and training and could result in some learners no longer taking up their course, possibly leading to NEETs or being forced to enrol onto the wrong course. Such a change in policy will have a clear impact on low income households.

Local transport infrastructure could lead to excessive journey times, exceeding the best practice guidance. In rural areas, the public transport network is just as much of a barrier as the cost of transport, and so designated student bus services need to be provided.

OPTION 2 - Introduce a charge for all Post 16 transport to all the educational establishments referred to in the current Transport Policy.

Do you agree with OPTION 2? No

OPTION 3 - Introduce a charge for all Post 16 transport to all educational establishments referred to in the current Transport Policy as in Option 2 but the charge be waived for learners who are eligible for free school meals.

Do you agree with OPTION 3? No – but the charge be waived for eligible learners

OPTION 4 - Discontinue learner transport for all Post 16 students and all learners to make their own arrangements

Do you agree with OPTION 4? No

OPTION 5 - Exclude Welsh Medium schools from Options 2 and 3.

Do you agree with OPTION 5? No

OPTION 6 - Exclude Welsh Medium and denominational schools from Options 2 and 3.

Do you agree with OPTION 6? No

OPTION 7 - Benefits Entitlement - maintain status quo and continue current benefits policy.

Do you agree with OPTION 7? Yes

OPTION 8 - Remove provision completely for all learners with effect from September 2020.

Do you agree with OPTION 8? No

OPTION 9 - Phase out benefits provision i.e. no new students to receive free transport under this criterion with effect from September 2020.

Do you agree with OPTION 9? No

7. Online Responses

7.1 The following tables show the groups of people who responded to the consultation and how many were received:

GROUP	NUMBER RECEIVED	% RECEIVED
Parent/carer	196	36.98%
Learner	248	46.79%
Teacher	12	2.26%
School support staff	4	0.75%
Governor	13	2.45%
Other*	57	10.75%
TOTAL	530	

*Includes students, local residents, relatives, parents, Councillors, Community Councillors.

STAKEHOLDER	Number
Parent, Abermorddu Primary School	1
Alun School, Mold - Parents	3
Alun School Mold -Learners	3
Alun School, Mold Teacher	1
Argoed High School - Parents	5
Argoed High School - Governors	2
Castell Alun - Parents	27
Castell Alun - Learner	1
Castell Alun - Governor	1
Coleg Cambria - Parents	10
Coleg Cambria - Learners	2
Coleg Cambria - Teacher	1

Coleg Cambria - Governors	2
Coleg Cambria - Other	2
Deeside 6 th - Parents	6
Elfed High School - Parents	5
Elfed High School – Governors	2
Elfed High School - Learner	1
Flint High School - Parents	11
Flint High School - Teachers	2
Hawarden High School - Parents	4
Hawarden High School - Learners	2
Holywell High School - Parent	1
Llysfasi - Parent	1
Maesglas - Parent	1
Northop College - Parent	1
Northop Community Council	1
Prestatyn High School - Parent	1
St Richard Gwyn - Parents	4
Sandycroft Primary - Parent	1
Sandycroft Primary - Governors	2
St David's High School - Learner	1
Venerable Edward Morgan - Governor	1
Yale College - Parent	1
Ysgol Derwen - Other	1
Ysgol Glanrafon - Parent	1
Ysgol Glanrafon - Learners	2
Ysgol Gwenffrwd - Parents	2
Ysgol Maes Garmon - Parents	41
Ysgol Maes Garmon - Learners	230
Ysgol Maes Garmon - Governors	2
Ysgol Maes Garmon - Teachers	8
Ysgol Maes Garmon - Other	22
Ysgol Mornant, Gwespyr - Parent	1